

Effect of insoluble materials on the volumetric behavior of rock salt

Mejda Azabou, Ahmed Rouabhi, Laura Blanco Martín

▶ To cite this version:

Mejda Azabou, Ahmed Rouabhi, Laura Blanco Martín. Effect of insoluble materials on the volumetric behavior of rock salt. Journal of Rock Mechanics and Geotechnical Engineering, 2021, 13 (1), pp.84-97. 10.1016/j.jrmge.2020.06.007 . hal-03155962

HAL Id: hal-03155962 https://minesparis-psl.hal.science/hal-03155962

Submitted on 10 Mar 2023 $\,$

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

Effect of insoluble materials on the volumetric behavior of rock salt

M. Azabou^{a,*}, A. Rouabhi^a, L. Blanco-Martín^a

³ ^aMINES ParisTech, PSL Research University, Centre de Géosciences, 35 rue St Honoré 77300 Fontainebleau, France

4 Abstract

2

This paper focuses on the presence of nodules of insoluble materials within salt specimens, and 5 their effect on the volumetric strain measurements and the dilatancy phenomenon. We analyzed 6 xperimental results of over 120 conventional triaxial compression tests, and found that in 20%7 of the cases the volumetric strain measurements were atypical. We also noted that the natural 8 variability of the specimens can lead to a non negligible data scattering in the volumetric strain 9 measurements, when different specimens are subjected to the same test. This is expected given 10 the small magnitude of those strains, but it occasionally implies that the corresponding specimens 11 are not representative of the volumetric behavior of the studied rock. In order to understand these 12 results, we conducted numerical investigations in which salt specimens are modeled as halite ma-13 trices with inclusions of impurities. Simulations of triaxial compression tests on these structures 14 proved that such heterogeneities can induce dilatancy: their presence led to the appearance of ten-15 sile zones which is physically translated into a micro-cracking activity. The modeling approach 16 was validated as the patterns displayed in the numerical results were identical to what is seen in 17 the laboratory. It was then employed to provide an explanation to the observed irregularities in 18 experimental results. We studied the natural variability effect as well and proposed a method-19 ology to overcome the issue of specimens representativity from both deviatoric and volumetric 20 perspectives. 21

22 Keywords: rock salt, dilatancy, material heterogeneity, natural variability, triaxial tests, virtual

23 laboratory

Preprint submitted to Journal of Rock Mechanics and Geotechnical Engineering

May 14, 2020

24 **1. Introduction**

Solution mined cavities in salt formations have been used for hydrocarbon storage for about 70 years (Bays, 1963). What made this technique conceivable in the first place is the excellent sealing capacity of rock salt due to its naturally low porosity and permeability (Popp and Kern, 1998; Wang et al., 2019). However, underground cavity opening in undisturbed rocks results in the creation of disturbed zones around the underground facility (DeVries et al., 2002, 2005; Habibi, 2019), where the stress state is far from being isotropic and can present high levels of deviatoric stress (DeVries et al., 2002; Tsang et al., 2005).

Laboratory tests on salt specimens have proven that, under compressive loading and above some level of deviatoric stress, rock salt can undergo an irreversible volume increase resulting from a micro-cracking activity (DeVries et al., 2005). This phenomenon is known as dilatancy and is associated with material damage since the micro-cracking activity weakens the material and allows the development of flow paths (Stormont, 1997; Schulze et al., 2001; DeVries et al., 2002). Figure 1 shows the dilatancy onset during a triaxial test conducted under a confining pressure of 4 MPa and a constant axial strain rate of $5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$.

^{*}Corresponding author *Email address:* mejda.azabou@mines-paristech.fr (M. Azabou)



Figure 1: Experimental data of a triaxial compression test on a rock salt specimen (test conducted at Mines ParisTech). Compressive strains are positive.

Due to the stress state distribution around the cavity, dilatancy is likely to occur, compromis-39 ing the integrity of the facility (DeVries et al., 2002; Wang et al., 2018; Labaune, 2018), hence the 40 importance of the experimental measurements of volumetric strain. However, rock salt dilatancy 41 usually occurs at small volumetric strains (typically below 0.4% (Roberts et al., 2015; Labaune, 42 2018; Rouabhi et al., 2019)), which is so small that rock salt viscoplastic deformation was con-43 sidered isochoric for years (Munson and Dawson, 1981; Tijani et al., 1983; Heusermann et al., 44 2003). Thus, getting the accurate data is a delicate task as factors like natural variability, specimen 45 heterogeneity, testing procedure or the used measurement techniques can significantly impact the 46 results. Studies on factors influencing the volumetric strain measurements have been carried out: 47 Medina-Cetina and Rechenmacher (2009); DeVries and Mellegard (2010) investigated the effect 48 of specimens preconditioning; Hou (2003); DeVries et al. (2005); Rouabhi et al. (2019) tackled 49 the effect of aspects of the loading conditions, and the measurement techniques effect was studied 50 in Rouabhi et al. (2019). 51

⁵² Natural variability is an inevitable bias since we are studying a geological material. As will be

shown throughout this paper, the natural variability of the specimens has a slight effect on the deviatoric behavior; the exhibited dispersion in axial strain measurements remains within the ranges of measurements errors. However, regarding the volumetric ones, and due to their small magnitude as already mentioned, the measured volumetric behavior can show a non negligible dispersion. And this means that the used specimens could be non representative of the corresponding rock salt on the volumetric level albeit they are so from a deviatoric point of view.

The work of Rouabhi et al. (2019) and further illustrations throughout this paper show that if we exclude the dysfunction of the measurement techniques, volumetric strain data given by different measurement techniques can exhibit differences that cannot be attributed to the testing conditions alone. This raises questions concerning the material heterogeneity as it can lead to spatial heterogeneities in the stress and strain fields.

There are numerous aspects of material heterogeneity, they can be microscopic, i.e., related to the 64 shape, size and orientation of the grains, related to fluid inclusions in grain boundaries or to the 65 type of halite crystals (see Chemin, 1990; Van-Hasselt, 1991; Speranza et al., 2016, and references 66 therein), as they can be macroscopic and visible on the specimen like the presence of nodules of 67 anhydrite or clay, or even fracture plans. More details into the microscopic and macroscopic as-68 pects of natural heterogeneity in rock salt can be found in the work of Speranza et al. (2016) and 69 the references therein. The impurities present in rock salt are usually clay, anhydrite and marl Gill-70 haus et al. (2006). Their mass fraction is usually determined in the process of site characterization. 71 It is a property that varies from one rock salt to another over a large range: in the Tersanne cavern 72 field in south eastern France, the mass fraction of impurities in the salt formation is less than 10%, 73 while in other formations this fraction can be greater than 50% (the Vauvert cavern field in south 74 France). 75

To the best of the authors' knowledge, no studies have been carried out to investigate neither the
effect of natural variability nor the impact of a specimen's spatial heterogeneity on the volumetric
strain measurements, especially since they are used to determine design criteria for salt caverns.

The main purpose of this paper is to understand the effect of material heterogeneity on the experimental measurements of volumetric strain and to propose a methodology to overcome the issue
of specimens representativity from a volumetric perspective. We chose to focus our work on the

presence of macroscopic nodules of insoluble materials within a supposedly pure halite matrix. Experimentally, investigating such factors is a delicate task as it requires precise data and cannot tolerate measurement errors and perturbations that are difficult to quantify. For this reason, we support our experimental investigation by an extensive numerical study. The use of a virtual laboratory will allow a better understanding of what is observed in the lab and will offer a ground to investigate the dilatancy phenomenon with a structural approach without the limitations of experimental works.

We mainly found that the dilatancy phenomenon could be a consequence of material heterogeneity 89 and that the presence of insoluble materials can explain some of the atypical observations in the 90 lab. We also showed how sensitive the volumetric strain measurements are to the natural variabil-91 ity of the specimens and proposed a methodology to overcome the issue of non representativity. 92 This paper is structured as follows. Section 2 is an experimental investigation that is focused on 93 the volumetric strain measurements. Section 3 briefly presents the constitutive model used in the 94 numerical study of section 4 during which the effect of heterogeneities on the volumetric behavior 95 is investigated. This study is purely mechanical, neither the thermal nor the hydraulic aspects were 96 taken into account. 97

98 2. Experimental data

We analyzed 11 experimental campaigns conducted at the Geosciences Department of Mines 99 ParisTech on salt specimens from different locations in France and in the US between 2004 and 100 2012. Each testing program is comprised of conventional uniaxial and triaxial compression tests 101 and creep tests. As volumetric strain measurements are only provided in triaxial compression tests, 102 we focused our analysis on those experiments and the total number of studied tests was about 123. 103 The tested specimens are 13 cm high cylinders with a slenderness ratio of 2. A triaxial compression 104 test consists in maintaining a constant confining pressure on the lateral surface of the specimen by 105 injecting/withdrawing a confining fluid into a triaxial cell, while imposing a constant axial strain 106 rate via loading platens between which the specimen is placed (Wawersik and Hannum, 1980; 107 Mellegard et al., 2005; Ulusay et al., 2007). 108

109 We distinguish two kinds of measurement techniques; "local" and "global". The local measure-

ments are given by strain gauges (axial and circumferential) placed at mid height of the specimen. 110 The global measurements use an LVDT (linear variable displacement transducer) sensor attached 111 to the loading platens and the amount of fluid injected or withdrawn from the cell (Rouabhi et al., 112 2019). Thus for the axial strain, the local measurement is given by the axial strain gauge and 113 the global one is given by the LVDT sensor. The measurements of the axial and circumferential 114 gauges are combined to get the local volumetric strain measurement whereas the axial displace-115 ment between the loading platens (measured by the LVDT) is combined with the amount of fluid 116 injected or withdrawn from the cell to get the global volumetric strain measurement. 117

In the following, let Q be the applied axial stress, P the confining pressure, |Q - P| the deviatoric stress and ζ the volumetric strain defined as:

$$\begin{cases} \zeta_g = -(V - V_i)/V_i \\ \zeta_l = -(2\varepsilon_\theta + \varepsilon_z) \end{cases}$$
(1)

where the subscripts g, l and i stand respectively for global, local and initial. The volume of the specimen is V, ε_{θ} and ε_z are the tangential and axial strains, respectively. Refer to Rouabhi et al. (2019) and references therein for further details on the given definitions.

123 2.1. Results and observations

The analysis of the experimental data and the examination of the corresponding specimens 124 showed that in about 80% of the tests, the difference between the local and global measurements 125 of axial strain is small and stays within the range of the uncertainty of the measurement techniques. 126 Regarding the volumetric strain, there is always a difference between global and local measure-127 ments as the strain gauges measure dilatancy onset before it is seen by the whole specimen, i.e., 128 before the global measurement indicates it. In these classic cases, the dispersion between local and 129 global measurements is in the range of what is seen in the tests presented in the work of Rouabhi 130 et al. (2019). Figure 2 shows the results of a typical test conducted under a constant strain rate of 131 5×10^{-5} s⁻¹ and a confining pressure of 12 MPa. In this figure, the evolution of the deviatoric stress 132 is presented as a function of global and local measurements of the axial and volumetric strains. As 133 it can be seen, the dilatancy onset given by the global technique is about 2 times higher than the 134

¹³⁵ one measured by the gauges, and this is a ratio that is seen in a large majority of the tests. On the ¹³⁶ other hand, the axial strain measurements present an acceptable dispersion.



Figure 2: Results of a conventional triaxial compression test (P=12 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) representative of 80% of the tests performed.

Regarding the remaining 20% of the tests, the local volumetric strain measurements are atypi-137 cal and their comparison with the global ones is out of the pattern described for 80% of the tests. 138 In these tests, we have cases where gauges indicate a higher deviatoric stress for dilatancy onset 139 than what the global technique indicates. We also see cases where the gauges measure only con-140 tractancy or dilatancy during the entire test period whereas the global technique shows that the 141 specimen undergoes contractancy and then dilatancy. Figures 3 to 6 give examples of these atyp-142 ical observations and show the corresponding specimens as well. In Figure 3 the deviatoric stress 143 corresponding to the global dilatancy onset is 8 times higher than the one measured by the local 144 technique. Figure 4 indicates that when the deviatoric stress ranges between 35 and 50 MPa, the 145 specimen undergoes a global increase in volume and a local contractancy at the same time. Figures 146 5 and 6 show that the local and global volumetric behaviors are significantly different during each 147 of these tests. 148



Figure 3: Results of a triaxial compression test (P= 12 MPa, $\dot{\epsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimen, an example of the irregularities observed in 20% of the performed tests.



Figure 4: Results of a triaxial compression test (P= 12 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimen, an example of the irregularities observed in 20% of the performed tests.



Figure 5: Results of a triaxial compression test (P= 12 MPa, $\dot{\epsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimen, an example of the irregularities observed in 20% of the performed tests.



Figure 6: Results of a triaxial compression test (P= 8 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimen, an example of the irregularities observed in 20% of the performed tests.

We have also studied the cases where the same test is conducted on two specimens in order to see to which extent could the natural variability affect the results and whether the resulting dispersion is acceptable. We observed that the natural variability does not have a significant effect on the axial strain, be it local or global, but it could significantly affect the volumetric behavior measurements. In Figures 7 to 9, we show 3 of these comparisons along with the concerned specimens.



Figure 7: Results of two identical triaxial compression tests (P= 8 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimens with difference in depths of 2.25 m.



Figure 8: Results of two identical triaxial compression tests (P= 12 MPa, $\dot{\epsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimens with difference in depths of 2.3 m.



Figure 9: Results of two identical triaxial compression tests (P= 10 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 2 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimens with difference in depths of 21.4 m.

155 2.2. Discussion

The analysis of these experimental data showed that it is possible for a specimen to display 156 a local response that is significantly different from the global one. The malfunction of the mea-157 surement techniques is excluded: we have analyzed the results and confirmed that the gauges have 158 been fully functional, we also assume that there were no oil leaks to alter the global measure-159 ment. Rouabhi et al. (2019) proved that the friction with the loading platens can in fact cause the 160 local measurements to deviate from the global ones but not to the observed extent. This can be 161 interpreted by the presence of material heterogeneity close to the placement of the gauges which 162 capture very local phenomena due to their size. 163

We have also seen that specimens that are considered representative of a given rock salt, can show a very similar deviatoric behavior when subjected to the same loading conditions but a different volumetric behavior: the dispersion is always more pronounced in the local measurements. This implies that, especially in terms of the volumetric response, our specimens could be smaller than the required representative element volume (REV) for the studied rock salt. Both of these observations can be traced back to the material spatial heterogeneity and among the many aspects of it (Chemin, 1990; Van-Hasselt, 1991; Thiemeyer et al., 2015; Speranza et al., 2016; Thiemeyer et al., 2016; Mansouri et al., 2019), we chose to focus this study on the presence of nodules of impurities similar to what can be seen on the specimen from Figure 4.

We investigate the effect of such heterogeneity on the volumetric behavior and the representativity of the used specimens. Rigorous experimental investigation of this aspect is problematic due to the following reasons:

- we do not have control over the material heterogeneity; as it was mentioned before, various
 aspects of heterogeneity exist within a salt sample which means that we cannot attribute a
 certain behavior to one particular aspect;
- the measured volumetric strains are extremely small (Roberts et al., 2015; Labaune, 2018;
 Rouabhi et al., 2019) which means the errors and uncertainties inherent to the laboratory
 work can be non negligible and can affect the measurements and therefore alter our interpretations and analysis;

in order to further investigate the representativity of the specimens, we need to perform
 typical triaxial compression tests on bigger samples. This is often complicated due to the
 limitations of the experimental facilities: typically a lab is equipped with cells that can host
 specimens heaving at most 2 or 3 particular diameters (respecting the dimensions specified
 in Ulusay et al. (2007)), and it is unrealistic to have a new cell each time there is a need to
 characterize a different rock.

Consequently, we decided to use a virtual laboratory built on numerical modeling and simulation tools. This will allow to investigate the effect of this particular aspect of heterogeneity on rock salt dilatancy in an attempt to understand the mentioned observations.

3. Constitutive model

This model has been developed by Rouabhi et al. (2019). It assumes an additive decomposition of the total strain rate tensor $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}$ into tensile $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}^{t}$ and compressive $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}^{c}$ parts. The compressive and tensile parts of the viscoplastic strain rate tensor $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}$ are decomposed in the basis ($\underline{I}, \underline{J}, \underline{K}$) defined as

$$\underline{I} = \underline{1}/\sqrt{3}, \quad \underline{J} = \underline{\sigma}'/||\underline{\sigma}'||, \quad \underline{K} = (\sqrt{2}\underline{I} + \ell\underline{J} - \sqrt{6}\underline{J}^2)/\sqrt{1-\ell^2}$$
(2)

¹⁹⁷ where $\underline{\sigma}'$ is the deviatoric part of the stress tensor $\underline{\sigma}$; and $\ell = \sqrt{6}tr(\underline{J}^3)$ is the third invariant of $\underline{\sigma}'$. ¹⁹⁸ Under compressive loading, the evolution law of $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{\nu p}^c$ can be written as

$$\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{\nu p}^{c} = -\sqrt{1/3} \dot{\zeta}_{\nu p}^{c} \underline{I} + \sqrt{3/2} \dot{\gamma}_{\nu p}^{c} \underline{N}^{c}$$
(3)

where $\dot{\zeta}_{vp}^{c} = -tr(\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}^{c})$ and $\dot{\gamma}_{vp}^{c} = \sqrt{2/3} ||\underline{\varepsilon}_{vp}^{c'}||$ are the rates of the volumetric strain and the viscoplastic distorsion, respectively and \underline{N}^{c} is a unit tensor defining the deviatoric flow direction under compressive loading.

²⁰² Under tensile loading, the strain rate tensor $\dot{\underline{\varepsilon}}_{=vp}^{t}$ is assumed to be described by a mechanism of ²⁰³ Rankine-type:

$$\frac{\dot{\varepsilon}^{t}}{\varepsilon_{vp}} = \dot{\lambda} \frac{\partial G}{\partial \underline{\sigma}}$$
(4)

204 with

$$G = \left(\langle \sigma_1 \rangle^d + \langle \sigma_2 \rangle^d + \langle \sigma_3 \rangle^d \right)^{1/d} \tag{5}$$

where $\dot{\lambda}$ is a positive multiplier, $\langle . \rangle$ are the Macaulay brackets, i.e. $\langle x \rangle = (x+|x|)/2$; $\sigma_1 \ge \sigma_2 \ge \sigma_3$ are the principal stresses of $\underline{\sigma}$; and $d \ge 1$ is a constant parameter.

²⁰⁷ When the gradient of *G* with respect to $\underline{\sigma}$ is written in the basis $(\underline{I}, \underline{J}, \underline{K})$, Equation 4 can be ²⁰⁸ rewritten as:

$$\frac{\dot{\varepsilon}^{t}}{=_{vp}} = -\sqrt{1/3}\dot{\zeta}^{t}_{vp}\underline{I} + \sqrt{3/2}\dot{\gamma}^{t}_{vp}\underline{N}^{t}$$
(6)

209 with

$$\dot{\zeta}_{vp}^{t} = -\dot{\lambda}X, \quad \dot{\gamma}_{vp}^{t} = \dot{\lambda}\sqrt{Y^{2} + Z^{2}} \tag{7}$$

where $\underline{\underline{N}}^{t}$ defines the deviatoric flow direction under tensile loading and the quantities *X*, *Y* and *Z* are such that

$$\begin{cases} X = G'_1 + G'_2 + G'_3 \\ Y = (2G'_1 - G'_2 - G'_3)/3 \\ Z = (G'_2 - G'_3)/\sqrt{3} \end{cases}$$
(8)

with $G'_i = \langle \sigma_i / G \rangle^{d-1}$ the eigenvalues of $\partial G / \partial \underline{\sigma}$.

Finally, the additive decomposition of the total strain rate tensor $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}$ into tensile $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}^{t}$ and compressive $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}^{c}$ parts, leads to

$$\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{=vp} = -\sqrt{1/3}\dot{\zeta}_{vp}\underline{I} + \sqrt{3/2}\left(\dot{\gamma}_{vp}^{c}\underline{N}^{c} + \dot{\gamma}_{vp}^{t}\underline{N}^{t}\right)$$
(9)

with $\dot{\zeta}_{vp} = \dot{\zeta}_{vp}^c + \dot{\zeta}_{vp}^t$. As can be seen from this Equation, the tensile contribution acts on both components of $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}$, volumetric and deviatoric.

²¹⁷ To fully define $\dot{\underline{\varepsilon}}_{\nu p}$, $\dot{\gamma}_{\nu p}^{c}$, $\dot{\zeta}_{\nu p}^{c}$ and $\dot{\lambda}$ need to be defined, which will be done as follows.

For the compressive part, the evolution law of $\dot{\zeta}_{vp}^c$ is expressed as

$$\dot{\zeta}_{\nu p}^{c} = \psi(\underline{\underline{\sigma}}, \gamma_{\nu p}^{c})\dot{\gamma}_{\nu p}^{c}$$
⁽¹⁰⁾

219 with

$$\psi(\underline{\underline{\sigma}}, \gamma_{\nu p}^{c}) = z \frac{\left\langle p/N \right\rangle^{n} - \gamma_{\nu p}^{c}}{\left\langle p/M \right\rangle^{m} + \gamma_{\nu p}^{c}}$$
(11)

and γ_{vp}^c is given through a generalization of Lemaitre model (Tijani et al., 1983), enriched with an influence of the mean pressure *p* and the Lode angle θ :

$$\frac{d(\gamma_{vp}^{c})^{1/a}}{dt} = \left\langle \left[q/\varrho(\theta) - \left(\gamma_{vp}^{c}\right)^{b} Bp - C \right] \middle/ K \right\rangle^{k/a}$$
(12)

In Equation 11, the sign of $\langle p/N \rangle^n - \gamma_{vp}^c$ indicates whether the behavior is contracting or dilating. Regarding the tensile part, we consider an evolution law of Perzyna-type:

$$\dot{\lambda} = \Lambda \langle (G - R_t) / S \rangle \rangle^s \tag{13}$$

In Equations 11 to 13, *z*, *n*, *m*, *a*, *b*, *B*, *C*, *K*, *k*, Λ , R_t , *d*, *s*, *M*, *N* and *S* are the material parameters. When this model is used to simulate a triaxial compression test, dilatancy is:

- taken into account on a constitutive level when we assume that the stress field within the specimen is homogeneous and all stresses are compressive (Equations 10 and 11);
- a result of a heterogeneous distribution of the stress field leading to activating the tension mechanism (Equations 7 and 13).

4. Numerical Investigations

We first present and validate our numerical approach which is then employed to investigate the volumetric strains measured by different measurement techniques on a salt specimen containing nodules of impurities. The natural variability, its effect on the volumetric strain measurements and the specimens representativity are discussed in section 4.3.

235 4.1. Structural approach for dilatancy

The micro structure of a salt specimen in reality is very complex to be reproduced numeri-236 cally (different grain sizes, fluid inclusions, grain boundaries, different types and shapes of het-237 erogeneities,...). In this work, we assume that salt is a two-phase medium composed of a pure 238 halite matrix and nodules of insoluble materials. This simplifying assumption is accepted, since 239 the aim of this research is to qualitatively understand the impact of the presence of heterogeneities 240 on the macroscopic behavior. Thus the numerical validation of the approach does not concern its 241 ability to reproduce the complex geometry of real salt specimens, but rather the measurements of 242 physical quantities. 243

A salt specimen is modeled as a cylindrical matrix of pure halite, with inclusions representing the 244 nodules of insolubles as shown in Figure 10. The insolubles are modeled as spheres for the sake 245 of simplicity and the specimens are generated as follows. First, a cube's side length, the volume 246 fraction of insolubles within the cube, the minimum and maximum radii (of the inclusions) are 247 designated. Second, an iterative process allows to generate, via a uniform random number gener-248 ator, the position of a sphere center (within the cube) and a radius (between the specified bounds); 249 the respect of the specified volume fraction is checked at each iteration. Finally, once the distri-250 bution of the spheres is generated within the cube, the position and size of the specimen to model 251 are chosen and the virtual sampling is performed. 252



Figure 10: Cutaway view of the modeled structure of a salt specimen with nodules of insolubles.

The structure shown in Figure 10 will be used as a reference specimen for our numerical investigations. It contains a volume fraction of inclusions of $\phi = 10.3\%$, the density of the halite matrix is assumed to be 2160 kg/m³ which leads to a mass fraction of w = 8.3%. Such mass fraction is within the usual ranges found in salt rocks (Gillhaus et al., 2006). The insolubles are considered to have properties similar to clay: a density of $\rho = 1700$ kg/m³, a Young's modulus of E = 5000 MPa and a Poisson's ratio of v = 0.32.

We assume the continuity of the displacement field within the structure, and we do not introduce a joint model for the interface halite-inclusions. This simplifying assumption was made because on one hand the joint parameters are difficult to determine experimentally and on the other hand, introducing additional parameters will further complicate the study especially with the meshing requirement of the modeled structures. The assumption is valid since, as will be shown through this paper, the macroscopic aspects of rock salt behavior are reproduced.

The behavior of the insolubles is assumed to be linear elastic while the salt matrix is governed by the constitutive law presented in section 3. The parameter set used for the salt matrix is presented in Table 1. This parameter set was adopted from Labaune (2018) where the distorsion and dilatancy parameters were obtained by fitting triaxial compression and creep tests, and fitting a Brazilian test provided the ones relative to the tension mechanism. In this work, some of these parameters are changed. The tensile strength is set to $R_t = 0$ (Equation 13) in compliance with setting the cohesion C = 0 (Equation 12). Also, setting the parameter B = 0 (Equation 12) means that we omit the mean pressure effect and setting z = 0 (Equation 11) implies that the viscoplastic volumetric strain due to compressive stresses is not considered. The tensile part is deactivated by setting the parameter $\Lambda = 0$ (Equation 13).

Elasticity					
Ε	ν				
20000	0.32				
Distorsion					
а	k	b	В	Κ	С
0.29	2.2	0.24	0	0.13	0
Dilatancy					
Z	п	Ν	т	М	
0	1.3	0.012	3.3	1.37	
Tension					
d	Λ	R_t	S	S	
10	0	0	1	1	

Table 1: Parameters used to simulate the behavior of the salt matrix. The unit system is such that strain is in μ m/m, stress is in MPa and time in days.

²⁷⁵ We used VIPLEF3D, a finite element code developped in the Geosciences Department of ²⁷⁶ Mines ParisTech(Tijani, 2008) to simulate a typical triaxial test on the structure shown in Fig-²⁷⁷ ure 10. The simulated test is conducted under a constant strain rate of 10^{-6} s⁻¹ and a confining ²⁷⁸ pressure of 5 MPa.

The results showed that within the salt matrix and around the spherical inclusions, zones where the principal major stress σ_1 is positive appear and continue to develop all along the simulation. Figure 11 shows the distribution of σ_1 within the salt matrix at an axial strain $\varepsilon_{ax} \approx 2\%$: the difference in rigidity of the inclusions and the halite matrix led to the appearance of tensile zones and to stress concentrations.



Figure 11: Cutaway (left) and transparent (right) views of the distribution of σ_1 (MPa) within the salt matrix at $\varepsilon_{ax} \approx 2\%$ (simulation of a typical triaxial compression test under a confinement of 5 MPa and an axial strain rate of 10^{-6} s⁻¹, on the specimen shown in Figure 10).

Because of these results, we re-conducted the same simulation except for activating the tensile part this time (the parameter Λ from Equation 13 was set to 5×10^4). Activating this component of the viscoplastic strain tensor means that in the halite matrix, irreversible strains are of two kinds: those governed by the deviatoric creep mechanism and those governed by the tensile mechanism, which obviously vanish under compressive loadings when the assumption of stress homogeneity usually made in the analysis of laboratory tests, is used.

The obtained results of the two performed simulations in terms of global measurements are given
 in Figure 12.



Figure 12: Results of simulations of a typical triaxial compression test under a confinement of 5 MPa and an axial strain rate of 10^{-6} s⁻¹, on the specimen shown in Figure 10.

The overall behavior of the structure has the same characteristics observed in the lab for salt 292 specimens during this type of tests: viscoplastic hardening, contractancy and dilatancy. This is 293 an important result because it shows that dilatancy can be a consequence of the material spatial 294 heterogeneity. In fact in this study, the presence of heterogeneities lead to the development of 295 stress concentrations and induced tensile stress zones which physically reflect the occurrence of a 296 micro-cracking activity and therefore dilatancy. We still need to validate the ability of the approach 297 to reproduce other characteristics like the mean pressure and the loading rate effects and most 298 importantly the creep behavior. We use the reference specimen from Figure 10 to simulate a series 299 of lab tests, as listed in Table 2. 300

Studied Aspect	$\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax}$ [s ⁻¹]	P [MPa]	Stages of $ Q - P $ [MPa]
Effect of loading rate	$10^{-6}, 5 \times 10^{-6}, 10^{-5}$	5	-
Effect of the mean pressure	10 ⁻⁶	0, 5, 10, 15	-
Creep behavior	-	5	5, 10

Table 2: Lab tests simulated on the specimen shown in Figure 10.

The results of these simulations are shown in Figures 14 to 15 and are considered very satisfactory as both effects of loading rate and mean pressure are correctly predicted. In fact, the dilatancy limit increases with the mean pressure (equivalent to confining pressure effect) and is significantly affected by the loading rate: the slower the test the lower the dilatancy limit (Labaune et al., 2018). Also the creep behavior is very similar to what is typically seen in the lab (Günther et al., 2015; Labaune et al., 2018).

These results have been obtained as well for other structures with different inclusions shape, distribution, size, volume fraction and different elastic constants. This approach is then assumed to be valid to describe rock salt behavior in the lab.



Figure 13: Results of simulations of typical triaxial tests (P=5 MPa) on the specimen in Figure 10 : effect of loading rate.



Figure 14: Results of simulations of typical triaxial tests ($\dot{\epsilon}_{ax} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$) on the specimen in Figure 10 : effect of confining pressure.



Figure 15: Results of a simulation of a typical triaxial multistage creep test (P=5 MPa) on the specimen in Figure 10.

310 4.2. Volumetric strain measurements on a heterogeneous specimen

We adopt the approach detailed in section 4.1 and the same parameter set given in Table 1 311 for the numerical study hereafter where we try to understand the experimental observations and 312 obtain a qualitative assessment of the effect of heterogeneities on the volumetric behavior of rock 313 salt. We simulated on the reference specimen in Figure 10, a conventional triaxial test under a 314 confining pressure of 5 MPa and a constant axial strain rate of 10^{-6} s⁻¹ (see Figure 13). We 315 modeled the placement of two sets of strain gauges on the specimen in an attempt to get local 316 strain measurements with the same procedure used in the lab. We have randomly chosen the 317 position of the two sets of gauges, the only conditions were that the sets have to be placed at mid-318 height and on the salt matrix's lateral surface. We chose to investigate the effect of the friction 319 with the platens as well so the simulation was conducted twice with the two extreme conditions of 320 specimen-platen contact: smooth contact with no friction between the specimen and the loading 321 platens and rough contact where there is a complete radial restraint on the specimen ends. This 322 last boundary condition causes the initially right cylinder specimen to deform into a barrel (triaxial 323 compression) or an hourglass (triaxial extension) shape (Labaune, 2018; Rouabhi et al., 2019). 324 Figure 16 shows the obtained results. 325



Figure 16: Results of a simulation of a typical triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{\varepsilon} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$) on the specimen in Figure 10. Curves in dashed and continuous lines correspond respectively to simulations with and without accounting for the friction with the loading platens.

These results show that the friction with the platens significantly affects the global volumetric strain measurements but it has a slight impact on the axial and the local volumetric strain measurements. The sets of gauges give very similar results in terms of both axial and volumetric strains, in fact this specimen does not have locations of inclusions concentration, instead the spheres are almost evenly distributed (see the transparent view in Figure 10). This leads to a sort of uniformity over the lateral surface : all gauges placed at mid-height of the specimen are likely to give very similar measurements; no gauge could be significantly more exposed to inclusions than others.

We often have specimens were the inclusions are not evenly distributed as can be seen on the specimen in Figure 4: in this sample we can see that there are areas on the lateral surface that are covered with insolubles and others that are almost clear. To study such cases, we conduct the same simulation on the specimen presented in Figure 17. In this case, we placed the first set of gauges near the inclusion we see on the lateral surface of the specimen and the second set on the opposite side (relatively furthest from inclusions). The results are shown in Figure 17.



Figure 17: Results of a simulation of a typical triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{\varepsilon} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding specimen.

We see similarly to what has been noted at the lab, the axial strain measurement is slightly 339 affected, the dispersion shown between global and local measurements is acceptable. Regarding 340 the volumetric strains, the difference is out of the usual ranges and patterns (see Figure 2). At a 34 deviatoric stress level of ≈ 4 MPa, the first set (closest to the inclusions) measures significantly 342 important radial strains due to the local appearance of tensile stresses (see Figure 11) and we see 343 a local dilatancy onset. On the other hand, the second set (furthest from the inclusions) only sees 344 contractancy until the end of the simulation: the radial strains in that location of the specimen were 345 never important because tensile stresses did not appear there. It is not until the deviatoric stress 346 reaches ≈ 27 MPa that the whole specimen's volume begins to increase. The information provided 347 by the sets of gauges are true but have unexpected patterns and dilatancy onset values because they 348 capture very local phenomena. 349

In this investigation we have provided a possible interpretation to cases like the ones presented in Figures 3 and 6. We have also given a possible explanation to one of the main conclusions of Rouabhi et al. (2019) which states that the friction with the loading platens cannot explain the difference observed between local and global measurements of the volumetric strain.

4.3. Natural Variability and Specimens Representativity

In this section, we investigate the representativity of specimens from a volumetric point of view. We generate a random distribution of spheres with radii ranging from 8 to 20 mm within $\approx 7\%$ of the volume of a 20 cm side length cube. As shown in Figure 18, we virtually sample this cube and generate 4 salt specimens that are 13 cm high with a diameter of 6.5 cm. The inclusions and the halite matrix have the properties mentioned in section 4.1. The mass fraction of insolubles in each specimen is indicated in Figure 18 as well.



Figure 18: A modeled salt block with virtually sampled specimens, the mass fraction of insolubles is indicated for each specimen.

For each of the four shown specimens, we simulate a conventional triaxial compression test where the axial strain rate is fixed at 10^{-6} s⁻¹ and the confining pressure at 5 MPa. The simulations continued until dilatancy onsets were globally seen. The results are shown in Figure 19 in terms of global measurements.



Figure 19: Results of a conventional triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{e} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$), on the specimens shown in Figure 18.

As shown in Figure 19, the axial strain measurements present slight deviations, while the vol-365 umetric ones are significantly different. Because of the size of the insolubles and their distribution 366 within the initial block, none of the sampled specimens were representative of the block from a 367 volumetric perspective. Testing bigger specimens might seem like an immediate and ideal solu-368 tion for this issue. However in practice, we may be constrained by the geometry of the available 369 triaxial cells as explained in section 2 and we may even face cases where the maximum testable 370 size (diameter equal to the coring diameter and a slenderness ratio of two) is not representative of 37 the rock in question. Besides, testing bigger specimens is likely to compromise the precision of 372 the obtained strain measurements; in fact the bigger the specimen, the bigger the required volume 373 of confining oil and the less accurate the obtained volumetric strain measurements. 374

We study a second case scenario, where we generate a random distribution of spheres with radii ranging from 5 to 10 mm within $\approx 5\%$ of the volume of a 20 cm side length cube. As shown in Figure 20, we virtually sample this cube and generate 3 salt specimens that are 13 cm high with a diameter of 6.5 cm. Using the same properties for the inclusions and the halite matrix as the previous case, the mass fraction of insolubles in each specimen is indicated in Figure 20. We simulate the same test as performed on the specimens shown in Figure 19 and we present the corresponding results in Figure 21.



Figure 20: A modeled salt block with virtually sampled specimens, the mass fraction of insolubles is indicated for each specimen



Figure 21: Results of a conventional triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{\varepsilon} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$), on the specimens shown in Figure 20.

In this case, the inclusions size is small compared to the dimensions of the specimen, in fact 382 for all three of the cases we have $R_{max}/R_{spec} \approx 0.29$ where R_{max} is the radius of the largest sphere 383 included within the halite matrix and R_{spec} is the radius of the specimen. Besides there are more 384 inclusions in these specimens (14 for C1, 12 for C2 and 13 for C3) than the ones from the first 385 scenario (Figure 18) and they are evenly distributed within the volumes. These reasons lead to 386 the fact that we see almost no dispersion neither in the axial nor in the volumetric strain measure-387 ments : we are addressing an equivalent homogeneous material. Consequently in similar cases, we 388 can safely adjust a phenomenological model and use the resulting parameter set for the concerned 389 underground facility. 390

To illustrate this, we use the same constitutive model introduced in section 3 to fit the curve C1 391 in Figure 21. We assume that the stress and strain fields within the specimen are homogeneous, 392 all the stresses are compressive and therefore the tensile mechanism cannot be activated. We set 393 $z \neq 0$ in order to reproduce the volumetric strain. In other words, the results shown in Figure 21 394 for the specimen C1, are considered experimental data to fit with the the proposed model under 395 the assumptions stated. Figure 22 shows the fitting of these data with the parameter set given in 396 Table 3. As it can be seen, the phenomenological model, where dilatancy is taken into account on 397 a constitutive level, matches very well the results. 398



Figure 22: Fitting of a conventional triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{\varepsilon} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$) conducted on specimen C1 shown in Figure 20.

Elasticity					
Ε	ν				
22523	0.29				
Distorsion					
а	k	b	В	Κ	С
0.21	2.7	0.29	0.03	0.1	0
Dilatancy					
Z.	n	Ν	т	М	
1.3	1.07	0.0012	2.05	0.0058	
Tension					
d	Λ	R_t	S	S	
10	0	0	1	1	

Table 3: Parameters used to fit the triaxial test results C1 shown in Figure 21. The unit system is such that strain is in μ m/m, stress is in MPa and time in days.

399 5. Conclusions

In this paper, the volumetric strain measurements were experimentally investigated through the analysis of over 120 typical triaxial compression tests on salt specimens from different locations. The difference between local and global measurements exhibited during this analysis, raised questions concerning the effect of material spatial heterogeneity on the volumetric behavior and consequently on the representativity of the used specimen. We chose to focus on a specific aspect of material heterogeneity: the presence of nodules of insoluble materials within a pure halite matrix, in order to obtain a qualitative understanding of the issue.

We carried out a numerical study during which salt specimens were considered as cylindrical matrices of pure halite with spherical inclusions. We proved that dilatancy can be a consequence of the specimen's material heterogeneity.

We then investigated the experimental observations and proved that the significant differences (in patterns and the measured dilatancy onsets) between local and global volumetric strain measurements, were satisfactorily explained by the material spatial heterogeneity.

Finally, we have shown found that the presence of nodules of insoluble materials within a salt rock could lead to representativity issues. And in that case, we propose the following general methodology :

- Characterize one of the used specimens (known to be not representative): volume fraction
 of insoluble materials, the nature of the inclusions (thus getting an estimation of their elastic
 constants), the concentration zones of heterogeneity.
- 419 2. Model this specimen as a structure as described in the beginning of section 4.1: a pure halite
 420 matrix with nodules of impurities.a two-phase medium composed of a pure halite matrix
 421 and nodules of insolubles.
- 3. Perform a history matching of the experimental data with a given constitutive model (in
 which dilatancy results from the activation of a tensile mechanism induced by the presence
 of heterogeneities) on the modeled structure.

- 425
 4. Once a parameter set is obtained, we model a representative specimen: containing much
 426 more inclusions of a negligible size compared to the dimensions of the specimen (similar to
 427 what is shown in Figure 20).
- 5. Simulate the test conducted in the lab on the representative specimen using the same constitutive model from step 3 the approach described in section 4.1 with the parameter set resulting from the previous history matching.
- 6. The obtained results are supposed to be representative of the rock in question. They can be
 fit with a given phenomenological constitutive model with the considerations taken in the
 fittings of section 4.3 assuming the homogeneity of the stress field. Dilatancy in the chosen
 model should be taken into account on a constitutive level.: t The resulting parameter set
 can then be used for the corresponding rock salt.

This methodology combines experimental work with numerical modeling in order to overcome specimens representativity issues and the limitations of laboratory testing procedures.

438 Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank their colleagues Michel Tijani and Faouzi Hadj-Hassen from
 MINES ParisTech for their valuable contributions.

441 **References**

- Bays, C. A., 1963. Use of salt cavities for underground storage. In: Symposium on Salt.; Northern Ohio Geological
 Society. Cleveland, Ohio, pp. 564–578.
- ⁴⁴⁴ Chemin, P., Nov. 1990. Etude du rôle des inclusions fluides dans les mécanismes de déformation des roches halitiques.
- 445 Application aux formations salifères du bassin bressan. Theses, Ecole Nationale des Ponts et Chaussées.
- 446 DeVries, K., Mellegard, K., October 2010. Effect of specimen preconditioning on salt dilation onset. In: SMRI fall
- ⁴⁴⁷ 2010 technical conference. Leipzig, Germany.
- DeVries, K., Mellegard, K., Callahan, G., Goodman, W., 2005. Cavern roof stability for natural gas storage in bedded
 salt. Technical report de-fg26-02nt41651, RESPEC, Rapid City, South Dakota.
- ⁴⁵⁰ DeVries, K. L., Mellegard, K. D., Callahan, G. D., 11 2002. Salt damage criterion proof-of-concept research. Techni ⁴⁵¹ cal report rsi-1675 de-fc26-00nt41026, RESPEC, Rapid city, South Dakota.
- 452 Gillhaus, A., Crotogino, F., Albes, D., 2006. Compilation and evaluation of bedded salt cavern characteristics impor-
- tant to successful cavern sealing, part 1: Worldwide bedded slat deposits and bedded salt cavern characteristics.
- ⁴⁵⁴ 2003-5-smri.solution mining research institute research project report.
- Günther, R.-M., Salzer, K., Popp, T., Lüdeling, C., 09 2015. Steady-state creep of rock salt: Improved approaches for
 lab determination and modelling. Rock Mechanics and Rock Engineering 48.
- Habibi, R., 2019. An investigation into design concepts, design methods and stability criteria of salt caverns. Oil Gas
 Sci. Technol. Rev. IFP Energies nouvelles 74, 14.
- 459 Heusermann, S., Rolfs, O., Schmidt, U., 2003. Nonlinear finite-element analysis of solution mined storage caverns in
- rock salt using the lubby2 constitutive model. Computers Structures 81 (8), 629 638, k.J Bathe 60th Anniversary
 Issue.
- Hou, Z., 2003. Mechanical and hydraulic behavior of rock salt in the excavation disturbed zone around underground
 facilities. International Journal of Rock Mechanics and Mining Sciences 40 (5), 725 738.
- Labaune, P., 10 2018. Comportement thermomécanique du sel gemme : Application au dimensionnement des cavités.
 Ph.D. thesis.
- Labaune, P., Rouabhi, A., Tijani, M., Blanco-Martín, L., You, T., Feb 2018. Dilatancy criteria for salt cavern design: A
 comparison between stress- and strain-based approaches. Rock Mechanics and Rock Engineering 51 (2), 599–611.
- 468 Mansouri, H., Prior, D. J., Ajalloeian, R., Elyaszadeh, R., 2019. Deformation and recrystallization mechanisms in-
- 469 ferred from microstructures of naturally deformed rock salt from the diapiric stem and surface glaciers of a salt
- diapir in southern iran. Journal of Structural Geology 121, 10 24.
- 471 Medina-Cetina, Z., Rechenmacher, A., 01 2009. Influence of boundary conditions, specimen geometry and material
- ⁴⁷² heterogeneity on model calibration from triaxial tests. International Journal for Numerical and Analytical Methods
- in Geomechanics 34, 627–643.
- 474 Mellegard, K., Callahan, G., Devries, K. L., 01 2005. Lode angle effects on the deformational properties of natural

- 475 rock salt. In: American Rock Mechanics Association.
- 476 Munson, D., Dawson, P., 1981. Salt constitutive modeling using mechanism maps. In: First conference on the me-
- 477 chanical behavior of salt. pp. 717–737.
- ⁴⁷⁸ Popp, T., Kern, H., 1998. Ultrasonic wave velocities, gas permeability and porosity in natural and granular rock salt.
- Physics and Chemistry of the Earth 23(3), 373 378.
- Roberts, L. A., Buchholz, S. A., Mellegard, K. D., Düsterloh, U., Nov 2015. Cyclic loading effects on the creep and
- dilation of salt rock. Rock Mechanics and Rock Engineering 48 (6), 2581–2590.
- Rouabhi, A., Labaune, P., Tijani, M., Gatelier, N., Hévin, G., 2019. Phenomenological behavior of rock salt: On the
- influence of laboratory conditions on the dilatancy onset. Journal of Rock Mechanics and Geotechnical Engineer-ing.
- Schulze, O., Popp, T., Kern, H., 2001. Development of damage and permeability in deforming rock salt. Engineering
 Geology 61 (2), 163 180, geosciences and Nuclear Waste Disposal.
- 487 Speranza, G., Vona, A., Vinciguerra, S., Romano, C., 2016. Relating natural heterogeneities and rheological properties
- 488 of rocksalt: New insights from microstructural observations and petrophysical parameters on messinian halites
- from the italian peninsula. Tectonophysics 666, 103 120.
- Stormont, J., 1997. In situ gas permeability measurements to delineate damage in rock salt. International Journal of
 Rock Mechanics and Mining Sciences 34 (7), 1055 1064.
- ⁴⁹² Thiemeyer, N., Habersetzer, J., Peinl, M., Zulauf, G., Hammer, J., 2015. The application of high resolution x-ray com-
- ⁴⁹³ puted tomography on naturally deformed rock salt: Multi-scale investigations of the structural inventory. Journal
 ⁴⁹⁴ of Structural Geology 77, 92–106.
- ⁴⁹⁵ Thiemeyer, N., Zulauf, G., Mertineit, M., Linckens, J., Pusch, M., Hammer, J., 2016. Microfabrics and 3d grain shape
- of gorleben rock salt: Constraints on deformation mechanisms and paleodifferential stress. Tectonophysics 676, 1
 19.
- Tijani, M., Apr. 2008. Contribution à l'étude thermomécanique des cavités réalisées par lessivage dans des formations
 géologiques salines. Habilitation à diriger des recherches, Université Pierre et Marie Curie Paris VI.
- Tijani, M., Vouille, G., Hugout, B., 1983. Le sel gemme en tant que liquide visqueux. In: Le sel gemme en tant que
 liquide visqueux. Melbourne, Australia, pp. 241–246.
- ⁵⁰² Tsang, C.-F., Bernier, F., Davies, C., 2005. Geohydromechanical processes in the excavation damaged zone in crys-
- talline rock, rock salt, and indurated and plastic clays—in the context of radioactive waste disposal. International
- Journal of Rock Mechanics and Mining Sciences 42 (1), 109 125.
- ⁵⁰⁵ Ulusay, R., Hudson, J., for Rock Mechanics. Commission on Testing Methods, I. S., 2007. The Complete ISRM
- ⁵⁰⁶ Suggested Methods for Rock Characterization, Testing and Monitoring: 1974-2006. International Society for Rock
- 507 Mechanics, Commission on Testing Methods.
- ⁵⁰⁸ Van-Hasselt, B., 12 1991. Évaluation qualitative du rôle de la texture dans le fluage du sel bressan. Ph.D. thesis.

- Wang, T., Li, J., Jing, G., Zhang, Q., Yang, C., Daemen, J., 2019. Determination of the maximum allowable gas
- pressure for an underground gas storage salt cavern a case study of jintan, china. Journal of Rock Mechanics and
- 511 Geotechnical Engineering 11 (2), 251 262.
- ⁵¹² Wang, T., Yang, C., Chen, J., Daemen, J., 2018. Geomechanical investigation of roof failure of china's first gas storage
- salt cavern. Engineering Geology 243, 59 69.
- 514 Wawersik, W. R., Hannum, D. W., 1980. Mechanical behavior of new mexico rock salt in triaxial compression up to
- 515 200c. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth 85 (B2), 891–900.

Effect of insoluble materials on the volumetric behavior of rock salt

M. Azabou^{a,*}, A. Rouabhi^a, L. Blanco-Martín^a

³ ^aMINES ParisTech, PSL Research University, Centre de Géosciences, 35 rue St Honoré 77300 Fontainebleau, France

4 Abstract

2

This paper focuses on the presence of nodules of insoluble materials within salt specimens, and 5 their effect on the volumetric strain measurements and the dilatancy phenomenon. We analyzed 6 xperimental results of over 120 conventional triaxial compression tests, and found that in 20%7 f the cases the volumetric strain measurements were atypical. We also noted that the natural 8 variability of the specimens can lead to a non negligible data scattering in the volumetric strain 9 measurements, when different specimens are subjected to the same test. This is expected given 10 the small magnitude of those strains, but it occasionally implies that the corresponding specimens 11 are not representative of the volumetric behavior of the studied rock. In order to understand these 12 results, we conducted numerical investigations in which salt specimens are modeled as halite ma-13 trices with inclusions of impurities. Simulations of triaxial compression tests on these structures 14 proved that such heterogeneities can induce dilatancy: their presence led to the appearance of ten-15 sile zones which is physically translated into a micro-cracking activity. The modeling approach 16 was validated as the patterns displayed in the numerical results were identical to what is seen in 17 the laboratory. It was then employed to provide an explanation to the observed irregularities in 18 experimental results. We studied the natural variability effect as well and proposed a method-19 ology to overcome the issue of specimens representativity from both deviatoric and volumetric 20 perspectives. 21

Keywords: rock salt, dilatancy, material heterogeneity, natural variability, triaxial tests, virtual
 laboratory

Preprint submitted to Journal of Rock Mechanics and Geotechnical Engineering

May 14, 2020

24 **1. Introduction**

Solution mined cavities in salt formations have been used for hydrocarbon storage for about 25 70 years (Bays, 1963). What made this technique conceivable in the first place is the excellent 26 sealing capacity of rock salt due to its naturally low porosity and permeability (Popp and Kern, 27 1998; Wang et al., 2019). However, underground cavity opening in undisturbed rocks results in the 28 creation of disturbed zones around the underground facility (DeVries et al., 2002, 2005; Habibi, 29 2019), where the stress state is far from being isotropic and can present high levels of deviatoric 30 stress (DeVries et al., 2002; Tsang et al., 2005). 31 Laboratory tests on salt specimens have proven that, under compressive loading and above some 32 level of deviatoric stress, rock salt can undergo an irreversible volume increase resulting from 33 a micro-cracking activity (DeVries et al., 2005). This phenomenon is known as dilatancy and 34 is associated with material damage since the micro-cracking activity weakens the material and 35 allows the development of flow paths (Stormont, 1997; Schulze et al., 2001; DeVries et al., 2002). 36

³⁷ Figure 1 shows the dilatancy onset during a triaxial test conducted under a confining pressure

of 4 MPa and a constant axial strain rate of 5×10^{-5} s⁻¹.

^{*}Corresponding author *Email address:* mejda.azabou@mines-paristech.fr (M. Azabou)



Figure 1: Experimental data of a triaxial compression test on a rock salt specimen (test conducted at Mines ParisTech). Compressive strains are positive.

Due to the stress state distribution around the cavity, dilatancy is likely to occur, compromis-39 ing the integrity of the facility (DeVries et al., 2002; Wang et al., 2018; Labaune, 2018), hence the 40 importance of the experimental measurements of volumetric strain. However, rock salt dilatancy 41 usually occurs at small volumetric strains (typically below 0.4% (Roberts et al., 2015; Labaune, 42 2018; Rouabhi et al., 2019)), which is so small that rock salt viscoplastic deformation was con-43 sidered isochoric for years (Munson and Dawson, 1981; Tijani et al., 1983; Heusermann et al., 44 2003). Thus, getting the accurate data is a delicate task as factors like natural variability, specimen 45 heterogeneity, testing procedure or the used measurement techniques can significantly impact the 46 results. Studies on factors influencing the volumetric strain measurements have been carried out: 47 Medina-Cetina and Rechenmacher (2009); DeVries and Mellegard (2010) investigated the effect 48 of specimens preconditioning; Hou (2003); DeVries et al. (2005); Rouabhi et al. (2019) tackled 49 the effect of aspects of the loading conditions, and the measurement techniques effect was studied 50 in Rouabhi et al. (2019). 51

⁵² Natural variability is an inevitable bias since we are studying a geological material. As will be

shown throughout this paper, the natural variability of the specimens has a slight effect on the deviatoric behavior; the exhibited dispersion in axial strain measurements remains within the ranges of measurements errors. However, regarding the volumetric ones, and due to their small magnitude as already mentioned, the measured volumetric behavior can show a non negligible dispersion. And this means that the used specimens could be non representative of the corresponding rock salt on the volumetric level albeit they are so from a deviatoric point of view.

The work of Rouabhi et al. (2019) and further illustrations throughout this paper show that if we exclude the dysfunction of the measurement techniques, volumetric strain data given by different measurement techniques can exhibit differences that cannot be attributed to the testing conditions alone. This raises questions concerning the material heterogeneity as it can lead to spatial heterogeneities in the stress and strain fields.

There are numerous aspects of material heterogeneity, they can be microscopic, i.e., related to the 64 shape, size and orientation of the grains, related to fluid inclusions in grain boundaries or to the 65 type of halite crystals (see Chemin, 1990; Van-Hasselt, 1991; Speranza et al., 2016, and references 66 therein), as they can be macroscopic and visible on the specimen like the presence of nodules of 67 anhydrite or clay, or even fracture plans. More details into the microscopic and macroscopic as-68 pects of natural heterogeneity in rock salt can be found in the work of Speranza et al. (2016) and 69 the references therein. The impurities present in rock salt are usually clay, anhydrite and marl Gill-70 haus et al. (2006). Their mass fraction is usually determined in the process of site characterization. 71 It is a property that varies from one rock salt to another over a large range: in the Tersanne cavern 72 field in south eastern France, the mass fraction of impurities in the salt formation is less than 10%, 73 while in other formations this fraction can be greater than 50% (the Vauvert cavern field in south 74 France). 75

To the best of the authors' knowledge, no studies have been carried out to investigate neither the
effect of natural variability nor the impact of a specimen's spatial heterogeneity on the volumetric
strain measurements, especially since they are used to determine design criteria for salt caverns.

The main purpose of this paper is to understand the effect of material heterogeneity on the experimental measurements of volumetric strain and to propose a methodology to overcome the issue
of specimens representativity from a volumetric perspective. We chose to focus our work on the

presence of macroscopic nodules of insoluble materials within a supposedly pure halite matrix. Experimentally, investigating such factors is a delicate task as it requires precise data and cannot tolerate measurement errors and perturbations that are difficult to quantify. For this reason, we support our experimental investigation by an extensive numerical study. The use of a virtual laboratory will allow a better understanding of what is observed in the lab and will offer a ground to investigate the dilatancy phenomenon with a structural approach without the limitations of experimental works.

We mainly found that the dilatancy phenomenon could be a consequence of material heterogeneity 89 and that the presence of insoluble materials can explain some of the atypical observations in the 90 lab. We also showed how sensitive the volumetric strain measurements are to the natural variabil-91 ity of the specimens and proposed a methodology to overcome the issue of non representativity. 92 This paper is structured as follows. Section 2 is an experimental investigation that is focused on 93 the volumetric strain measurements. Section 3 briefly presents the constitutive model used in the 94 numerical study of section 4 during which the effect of heterogeneities on the volumetric behavior 95 is investigated. This study is purely mechanical, neither the thermal nor the hydraulic aspects were 96

⁹⁷ taken into account.

98 2. Experimental data

We analyzed 11 experimental campaigns conducted at the Geosciences Department of Mines 99 ParisTech on salt specimens from different locations in France and in the US between 2004 and 100 2012. Each testing program is comprised of conventional uniaxial and triaxial compression tests 101 and creep tests. As volumetric strain measurements are only provided in triaxial compression tests, 102 we focused our analysis on those experiments and the total number of studied tests was about 123. 103 The tested specimens are 13 cm high cylinders with a slenderness ratio of 2. A triaxial compression 104 test consists in maintaining a constant confining pressure on the lateral surface of the specimen by 105 injecting/withdrawing a confining fluid into a triaxial cell, while imposing a constant axial strain 106 rate via loading platens between which the specimen is placed (Wawersik and Hannum, 1980; 107 Mellegard et al., 2005; Ulusay et al., 2007). 108

109 We distinguish two kinds of measurement techniques; "local" and "global". The local measure-

ments are given by strain gauges (axial and circumferential) placed at mid height of the specimen. 110 The global measurements use an LVDT (linear variable displacement transducer) sensor attached 111 to the loading platens and the amount of fluid injected or withdrawn from the cell (Rouabhi et al., 112 2019). Thus for the axial strain, the local measurement is given by the axial strain gauge and 113 the global one is given by the LVDT sensor. The measurements of the axial and circumferential 114 gauges are combined to get the local volumetric strain measurement whereas the axial displace-115 ment between the loading platens (measured by the LVDT) is combined with the amount of fluid 116 injected or withdrawn from the cell to get the global volumetric strain measurement. 117

In the following, let Q be the applied axial stress, P the confining pressure, |Q - P| the deviatoric stress and ζ the volumetric strain defined as:

$$\begin{cases} \zeta_g = -(V - V_i)/V_i \\ \zeta_l = -(2\varepsilon_\theta + \varepsilon_z) \end{cases}$$
(1)

where the subscripts g, l and i stand respectively for global, local and initial. The volume of the specimen is V, ε_{θ} and ε_z are the tangential and axial strains, respectively. Refer to Rouabhi et al. (2019) and references therein for further details on the given definitions.

123 2.1. Results and observations

The analysis of the experimental data and the examination of the corresponding specimens 124 showed that in about 80% of the tests, the difference between the local and global measurements 125 of axial strain is small and stays within the range of the uncertainty of the measurement techniques. 126 Regarding the volumetric strain, there is always a difference between global and local measure-127 ments as the strain gauges measure dilatancy onset before it is seen by the whole specimen, i.e., 128 before the global measurement indicates it. In these classic cases, the dispersion between local and 129 global measurements is in the range of what is seen in the tests presented in the work of Rouabhi 130 et al. (2019). Figure 2 shows the results of a typical test conducted under a constant strain rate of 131 5×10^{-5} s⁻¹ and a confining pressure of 12 MPa. In this figure, the evolution of the deviatoric stress 132 is presented as a function of global and local measurements of the axial and volumetric strains. As 133 it can be seen, the dilatancy onset given by the global technique is about 2 times higher than the 134

¹³⁵ one measured by the gauges, and this is a ratio that is seen in a large majority of the tests. On the ¹³⁶ other hand, the axial strain measurements present an acceptable dispersion.



Figure 2: Results of a conventional triaxial compression test (P=12 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) representative of 80% of the tests performed.

Regarding the remaining 20% of the tests, the local volumetric strain measurements are atypi-137 cal and their comparison with the global ones is out of the pattern described for 80% of the tests. 138 In these tests, we have cases where gauges indicate a higher deviatoric stress for dilatancy onset 139 than what the global technique indicates. We also see cases where the gauges measure only con-140 tractancy or dilatancy during the entire test period whereas the global technique shows that the 141 specimen undergoes contractancy and then dilatancy. Figures 3 to 6 give examples of these atyp-142 ical observations and show the corresponding specimens as well. In Figure 3 the deviatoric stress 143 corresponding to the global dilatancy onset is 8 times higher than the one measured by the local 144 technique. Figure 4 indicates that when the deviatoric stress ranges between 35 and 50 MPa, the 145 specimen undergoes a global increase in volume and a local contractancy at the same time. Figures 146 5 and 6 show that the local and global volumetric behaviors are significantly different during each 147 of these tests. 148



Figure 3: Results of a triaxial compression test (P= 12 MPa, $\dot{\epsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimen, an example of the irregularities observed in 20% of the performed tests.



Figure 4: Results of a triaxial compression test (P= 12 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimen, an example of the irregularities observed in 20% of the performed tests.



Figure 5: Results of a triaxial compression test (P= 12 MPa, $\dot{\epsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimen, an example of the irregularities observed in 20% of the performed tests.



Figure 6: Results of a triaxial compression test (P= 8 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimen, an example of the irregularities observed in 20% of the performed tests.

We have also studied the cases where the same test is conducted on two specimens in order to see to which extent could the natural variability affect the results and whether the resulting dispersion is acceptable. We observed that the natural variability does not have a significant effect on the axial strain, be it local or global, but it could significantly affect the volumetric behavior measurements. In Figures 7 to 9, we show 3 of these comparisons along with the concerned specimens.



Figure 7: Results of two identical triaxial compression tests (P= 8 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimens with difference in depths of 2.25 m.



Figure 8: Results of two identical triaxial compression tests (P= 12 MPa, $\dot{\epsilon}_{ax} = 5 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimens with difference in depths of 2.3 m.



Figure 9: Results of two identical triaxial compression tests (P= 10 MPa, $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax} = 2 \times 10^{-5} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding tested salt specimens with difference in depths of 21.4 m.

155 2.2. Discussion

The analysis of these experimental data showed that it is possible for a specimen to display 156 a local response that is significantly different from the global one. The malfunction of the mea-157 surement techniques is excluded: we have analyzed the results and confirmed that the gauges have 158 been fully functional, we also assume that there were no oil leaks to alter the global measure-159 ment. Rouabhi et al. (2019) proved that the friction with the loading platens can in fact cause the 160 local measurements to deviate from the global ones but not to the observed extent. This can be 161 interpreted by the presence of material heterogeneity close to the placement of the gauges which 162 capture very local phenomena due to their size. 163

We have also seen that specimens that are considered representative of a given rock salt, can show a very similar deviatoric behavior when subjected to the same loading conditions but a different volumetric behavior: the dispersion is always more pronounced in the local measurements. This implies that, especially in terms of the volumetric response, our specimens could be smaller than the required representative element volume (REV) for the studied rock salt. Both of these observations can be traced back to the material spatial heterogeneity and among the many aspects of it (Chemin, 1990; Van-Hasselt, 1991; Thiemeyer et al., 2015; Speranza et al., 2016; Thiemeyer et al., 2016; Mansouri et al., 2019), we chose to focus this study on the presence of nodules of impurities similar to what can be seen on the specimen from Figure 4.

We investigate the effect of such heterogeneity on the volumetric behavior and the representativity of the used specimens. Rigorous experimental investigation of this aspect is problematic due to the following reasons:

- we do not have control over the material heterogeneity; as it was mentioned before, various
 aspects of heterogeneity exist within a salt sample which means that we cannot attribute a
 certain behavior to one particular aspect;
- the measured volumetric strains are extremely small (Roberts et al., 2015; Labaune, 2018;
 Rouabhi et al., 2019) which means the errors and uncertainties inherent to the laboratory
 work can be non negligible and can affect the measurements and therefore alter our interpretations and analysis;

in order to further investigate the representativity of the specimens, we need to perform
 typical triaxial compression tests on bigger samples. This is often complicated due to the
 limitations of the experimental facilities: typically a lab is equipped with cells that can host
 specimens heaving at most 2 or 3 particular diameters (respecting the dimensions specified
 in Ulusay et al. (2007)), and it is unrealistic to have a new cell each time there is a need to
 characterize a different rock.

Consequently, we decided to use a virtual laboratory built on numerical modeling and simulation tools. This will allow to investigate the effect of this particular aspect of heterogeneity on rock salt dilatancy in an attempt to understand the mentioned observations.

3. Constitutive model

This model has been developed by Rouabhi et al. (2019). It assumes an additive decomposition of the total strain rate tensor $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}$ into tensile $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}^{t}$ and compressive $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}^{c}$ parts. The compressive and tensile parts of the viscoplastic strain rate tensor $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}$ are decomposed in the basis ($\underline{I}, \underline{J}, \underline{K}$) defined as

$$\underline{\underline{I}} = \underline{\underline{1}}/\sqrt{3}, \quad \underline{\underline{J}} = \underline{\underline{\sigma}}'/||\underline{\underline{\sigma}}'||, \quad \underline{\underline{K}} = (\sqrt{2}\underline{\underline{I}} + \ell\underline{\underline{J}} - \sqrt{6}\underline{\underline{J}}^2)/\sqrt{1-\ell^2}$$
(2)

¹⁹⁷ where $\underline{\sigma}'$ is the deviatoric part of the stress tensor $\underline{\sigma}$; and $\ell = \sqrt{6}tr(\underline{J}^3)$ is the third invariant of $\underline{\sigma}'$. ¹⁹⁸ Under compressive loading, the evolution law of $\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{\nu p}^c$ can be written as

$$\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{\nu p}^{c} = -\sqrt{1/3} \dot{\zeta}_{\nu p}^{c} \underline{I} + \sqrt{3/2} \dot{\gamma}_{\nu p}^{c} \underline{N}^{c}$$
(3)

where $\dot{\zeta}_{vp}^{c} = -tr(\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{vp}^{c})$ and $\dot{\gamma}_{vp}^{c} = \sqrt{2/3} ||\underline{\varepsilon}_{vp}^{c'}||$ are the rates of the volumetric strain and the viscoplastic distorsion, respectively and \underline{N}^{c} is a unit tensor defining the deviatoric flow direction under compressive loading.

²⁰² Under tensile loading, the strain rate tensor $\dot{\underline{\varepsilon}}_{=vp}^{t}$ is assumed to be described by a mechanism of ²⁰³ Rankine-type:

$$\frac{\dot{\varepsilon}^{t}}{=_{vp}} = \dot{\lambda} \frac{\partial G}{\partial \underline{\sigma}}$$
(4)

204 with

$$G = \left(\langle \sigma_1 \rangle^d + \langle \sigma_2 \rangle^d + \langle \sigma_3 \rangle^d\right)^{1/d} \tag{5}$$

where $\dot{\lambda}$ is a positive multiplier, $\langle . \rangle$ are the Macaulay brackets, i.e. $\langle x \rangle = (x+|x|)/2$; $\sigma_1 \ge \sigma_2 \ge \sigma_3$ are the principal stresses of $\underline{\sigma}$; and $d \ge 1$ is a constant parameter.

²⁰⁷ When the gradient of *G* with respect to $\underline{\sigma}$ is written in the basis $(\underline{I}, \underline{J}, \underline{K})$, Equation 4 can be ²⁰⁸ rewritten as:

$$\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{\nu p}^{t} = -\sqrt{1/3} \dot{\zeta}_{\nu p}^{t} \underline{I} + \sqrt{3/2} \dot{\gamma}_{\nu p}^{t} \underline{N}^{t}$$
(6)

209 with

$$\dot{\zeta}_{vp}^{t} = -\dot{\lambda}X, \quad \dot{\gamma}_{vp}^{t} = \dot{\lambda}\sqrt{Y^{2} + Z^{2}}$$
(7)

where $\underline{\underline{N}}^{t}$ defines the deviatoric flow direction under tensile loading and the quantities *X*, *Y* and *Z* are such that

$$\begin{cases} X = G'_1 + G'_2 + G'_3 \\ Y = (2G'_1 - G'_2 - G'_3)/3 \\ Z = (G'_2 - G'_3)/\sqrt{3} \end{cases}$$
(8)

with $G'_i = \langle \sigma_i / G \rangle^{d-1}$ the eigenvalues of $\partial G / \partial \underline{\sigma}$.

Finally, the additive decomposition of the total strain rate tensor $\dot{\underline{\varepsilon}}_{=vp}$ into tensile $\dot{\underline{\varepsilon}}_{=vp}^{t}$ and compressive $\dot{\underline{\varepsilon}}_{=vp}^{c}$ parts, leads to

$$\underline{\dot{\varepsilon}}_{=vp} = -\sqrt{1/3}\dot{\zeta}_{vp}\underline{I} + \sqrt{3/2}\left(\dot{\gamma}_{vp}^{c}\underline{N}^{c} + \dot{\gamma}_{vp}^{t}\underline{N}^{t}\right)$$
(9)

with $\dot{\zeta}_{vp} = \dot{\zeta}_{vp}^c + \dot{\zeta}_{vp}^t$. As can be seen from this Equation, the tensile contribution acts on both components of $\dot{\varepsilon}_{vp}$, volumetric and deviatoric.

To fully define $\dot{\underline{\varepsilon}}_{p,p}$, $\dot{\gamma}_{vp}^{c}$, $\dot{\zeta}_{vp}^{c}$ and $\dot{\lambda}$ need to be defined, which will be done as follows.

For the compressive part, the evolution law of $\dot{\zeta}_{vp}^c$ is expressed as

$$\dot{\zeta}_{\nu p}^{c} = \psi(\underline{\underline{\sigma}}, \gamma_{\nu p}^{c}) \dot{\gamma}_{\nu p}^{c} \tag{10}$$

219 with

$$\psi(\underline{\sigma}, \gamma_{vp}^{c}) = z \frac{\left\langle p/N \right\rangle^{n} - \gamma_{vp}^{c}}{\left\langle p/M \right\rangle^{m} + \gamma_{vp}^{c}}$$
(11)

and γ_{vp}^c is given through a generalization of Lemaitre model (Tijani et al., 1983), enriched with an influence of the mean pressure *p* and the Lode angle θ :

$$\frac{d\left(\gamma_{vp}^{c}\right)^{1/a}}{dt} = \left\langle \left[q/\varrho(\theta) - \left(\gamma_{vp}^{c}\right)^{b}Bp - C\right] \middle/ K \right\rangle^{k/a}$$
(12)

In Equation 11, the sign of $\langle p/N \rangle^n - \gamma_{vp}^c$ indicates whether the behavior is contracting or dilating. Regarding the tensile part, we consider an evolution law of Perzyna-type:

$$\dot{\lambda} = \Lambda \langle (G - R_t) / S \rangle \rangle^s \tag{13}$$

In Equations 11 to 13, z, n, m, a, b, B, C, K, k, Λ , R_t , d, s, M, N and S are the material parameters. 224 When this model is used to simulate a triaxial compression test, dilatancy is: 225

- taken into account on a constitutive level when we assume that the stress field within the 226 specimen is homogeneous and all stresses are compressive (Equations 10 and 11); 227
- 228

229

• a result of a heterogeneous distribution of the stress field leading to activating the tension mechanism (Equations 7 and 13).

4. Numerical Investigations

We first present and validate our numerical approach which is then employed to investigate the volumetric strains measured by different measurement techniques on a salt specimen containing nodules of impurities. The natural variability, its effect on the volumetric strain measurements and the specimens representativity are discussed in section 4.3.

235 4.1. Structural approach for dilatancy

The micro structure of a salt specimen in reality is very complex to be reproduced numeri-236 cally (different grain sizes, fluid inclusions, grain boundaries, different types and shapes of het-237 erogeneities,...). In this work, we assume that salt is a two-phase medium composed of a pure 238 halite matrix and nodules of insoluble materials. This simplifying assumption is accepted, since 239 the aim of this research is to qualitatively understand the impact of the presence of heterogeneities 240 on the macroscopic behavior. Thus the numerical validation of the approach does not concern its 241 ability to reproduce the complex geometry of real salt specimens, but rather the measurements of 242 physical quantities. 243

A salt specimen is modeled as a cylindrical matrix of pure halite, with inclusions representing the 244 nodules of insolubles as shown in Figure 10. The insolubles are modeled as spheres for the sake 245 of simplicity and the specimens are generated as follows. First, a cube's side length, the volume 246 fraction of insolubles within the cube, the minimum and maximum radii (of the inclusions) are 247 designated. Second, an iterative process allows to generate, via a uniform random number gener-248 ator, the position of a sphere center (within the cube) and a radius (between the specified bounds); 249 the respect of the specified volume fraction is checked at each iteration. Finally, once the distri-250 bution of the spheres is generated within the cube, the position and size of the specimen to model 251 are chosen and the virtual sampling is performed. 252



Figure 10: Cutaway view of the modeled structure of a salt specimen with nodules of insolubles.

The structure shown in Figure 10 will be used as a reference specimen for our numerical investigations. It contains a volume fraction of inclusions of $\phi = 10.3\%$, the density of the halite matrix is assumed to be 2160 kg/m³ which leads to a mass fraction of w = 8.3%. Such mass fraction is within the usual ranges found in salt rocks (Gillhaus et al., 2006). The insolubles are considered to have properties similar to clay: a density of $\rho = 1700$ kg/m³, a Young's modulus of E = 5000 MPa and a Poisson's ratio of v = 0.32.

We assume the continuity of the displacement field within the structure, and we do not introduce a joint model for the interface halite-inclusions. This simplifying assumption was made because on one hand the joint parameters are difficult to determine experimentally and on the other hand, introducing additional parameters will further complicate the study especially with the meshing requirement of the modeled structures. The assumption is valid since, as will be shown through this paper, the macroscopic aspects of rock salt behavior are reproduced.

The behavior of the insolubles is assumed to be linear elastic while the salt matrix is governed by the constitutive law presented in section 3. The parameter set used for the salt matrix is presented in Table 1. This parameter set was adopted from Labaune (2018) where the distorsion and dilatancy parameters were obtained by fitting triaxial compression and creep tests, and fitting a Brazilian test provided the ones relative to the tension mechanism. In this work, some of these parameters are changed. The tensile strength is set to $R_t = 0$ (Equation 13) in compliance with setting the cohesion C = 0 (Equation 12). Also, setting the parameter B = 0 (Equation 12) means that we omit the mean pressure effect and setting z = 0 (Equation 11) implies that the viscoplastic volumetric strain due to compressive stresses is not considered. The tensile part is deactivated by setting the parameter $\Lambda = 0$ (Equation 13).

Elasticity					
Ε	ν				
20000	0.32				
Distorsion					
а	k	b	В	K	С
0.29	2.2	0.24	0	0.13	0
Dilatancy					
Z	п	Ν	т	М	
0	1.3	0.012	3.3	1.37	
Tension					
d	Λ	R_t	S	S	
10	0	0	1	1	

Table 1: Parameters used to simulate the behavior of the salt matrix. The unit system is such that strain is in μ m/m, stress is in MPa and time in days.

²⁷⁵ We used VIPLEF3D, a finite element code developped in the Geosciences Department of ²⁷⁶ Mines ParisTech(Tijani, 2008) to simulate a typical triaxial test on the structure shown in Fig-²⁷⁷ ure 10. The simulated test is conducted under a constant strain rate of 10^{-6} s⁻¹ and a confining ²⁷⁸ pressure of 5 MPa.

The results showed that within the salt matrix and around the spherical inclusions, zones where the principal major stress σ_1 is positive appear and continue to develop all along the simulation. Figure 11 shows the distribution of σ_1 within the salt matrix at an axial strain $\varepsilon_{ax} \approx 2\%$: the difference in rigidity of the inclusions and the halite matrix led to the appearance of tensile zones and to stress concentrations.



Figure 11: Cutaway (left) and transparent (right) views of the distribution of σ_1 (MPa) within the salt matrix at $\varepsilon_{ax} \approx 2\%$ (simulation of a typical triaxial compression test under a confinement of 5 MPa and an axial strain rate of 10^{-6} s⁻¹, on the specimen shown in Figure 10).

Because of these results, we re-conducted the same simulation except for activating the tensile part this time (the parameter Λ from Equation 13 was set to 5×10^4). Activating this component of the viscoplastic strain tensor means that in the halite matrix, irreversible strains are of two kinds: those governed by the deviatoric creep mechanism and those governed by the tensile mechanism, which obviously vanish under compressive loadings when the assumption of stress homogeneity usually made in the analysis of laboratory tests, is used.

The obtained results of the two performed simulations in terms of global measurements are given
 in Figure 12.



Figure 12: Results of simulations of a typical triaxial compression test under a confinement of 5 MPa and an axial strain rate of 10^{-6} s⁻¹, on the specimen shown in Figure 10.

The overall behavior of the structure has the same characteristics observed in the lab for salt 292 specimens during this type of tests: viscoplastic hardening, contractancy and dilatancy. This is 293 an important result because it shows that dilatancy can be a consequence of the material spatial 294 heterogeneity. In fact in this study, the presence of heterogeneities lead to the development of 295 stress concentrations and induced tensile stress zones which physically reflect the occurrence of a 296 micro-cracking activity and therefore dilatancy. We still need to validate the ability of the approach 297 to reproduce other characteristics like the mean pressure and the loading rate effects and most 298 importantly the creep behavior. We use the reference specimen from Figure 10 to simulate a series 299 of lab tests, as listed in Table 2. 300

Studied Aspect	$\dot{\varepsilon}_{ax}$ [s ⁻¹]	P [MPa]	Stages of $ Q - P $ [MPa]
Effect of loading rate	$10^{-6}, 5 \times 10^{-6}, 10^{-5}$	5	-
Effect of the mean pressure	10 ⁻⁶	0, 5, 10, 15	-
Creep behavior	-	5	5, 10

Table 2: Lab tests simulated on the specimen shown in Figure 10.

The results of these simulations are shown in Figures 14 to 15 and are considered very satisfactory as both effects of loading rate and mean pressure are correctly predicted. In fact, the dilatancy limit increases with the mean pressure (equivalent to confining pressure effect) and is significantly affected by the loading rate: the slower the test the lower the dilatancy limit (Labaune et al., 2018). Also the creep behavior is very similar to what is typically seen in the lab (Günther et al., 2015; Labaune et al., 2018).

These results have been obtained as well for other structures with different inclusions shape, distribution, size, volume fraction and different elastic constants. This approach is then assumed to be valid to describe rock salt behavior in the lab.



Figure 13: Results of simulations of typical triaxial tests (P=5 MPa) on the specimen in Figure 10 : effect of loading rate.



Figure 14: Results of simulations of typical triaxial tests ($\dot{\epsilon}_{ax} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$) on the specimen in Figure 10 : effect of confining pressure.



Figure 15: Results of a simulation of a typical triaxial multistage creep test (P=5 MPa) on the specimen in Figure 10.

310 4.2. Volumetric strain measurements on a heterogeneous specimen

We adopt the approach detailed in section 4.1 and the same parameter set given in Table 1 311 for the numerical study hereafter where we try to understand the experimental observations and 312 obtain a qualitative assessment of the effect of heterogeneities on the volumetric behavior of rock 313 salt. We simulated on the reference specimen in Figure 10, a conventional triaxial test under a 314 confining pressure of 5 MPa and a constant axial strain rate of 10^{-6} s⁻¹ (see Figure 13). We 315 modeled the placement of two sets of strain gauges on the specimen in an attempt to get local 316 strain measurements with the same procedure used in the lab. We have randomly chosen the 317 position of the two sets of gauges, the only conditions were that the sets have to be placed at mid-318 height and on the salt matrix's lateral surface. We chose to investigate the effect of the friction 319 with the platens as well so the simulation was conducted twice with the two extreme conditions of 320 specimen-platen contact: smooth contact with no friction between the specimen and the loading 321 platens and rough contact where there is a complete radial restraint on the specimen ends. This 322 last boundary condition causes the initially right cylinder specimen to deform into a barrel (triaxial 323 compression) or an hourglass (triaxial extension) shape (Labaune, 2018; Rouabhi et al., 2019). 324 Figure 16 shows the obtained results. 325



Figure 16: Results of a simulation of a typical triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{\varepsilon} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$) on the specimen in Figure 10. Curves in dashed and continuous lines correspond respectively to simulations with and without accounting for the friction with the loading platens.

These results show that the friction with the platens significantly affects the global volumetric strain measurements but it has a slight impact on the axial and the local volumetric strain measurements. The sets of gauges give very similar results in terms of both axial and volumetric strains, in fact this specimen does not have locations of inclusions concentration, instead the spheres are almost evenly distributed (see the transparent view in Figure 10). This leads to a sort of uniformity over the lateral surface : all gauges placed at mid-height of the specimen are likely to give very similar measurements; no gauge could be significantly more exposed to inclusions than others.

We often have specimens were the inclusions are not evenly distributed as can be seen on the specimen in Figure 4: in this sample we can see that there are areas on the lateral surface that are covered with insolubles and others that are almost clear. To study such cases, we conduct the same simulation on the specimen presented in Figure 17. In this case, we placed the first set of gauges near the inclusion we see on the lateral surface of the specimen and the second set on the opposite side (relatively furthest from inclusions). The results are shown in Figure 17.



Figure 17: Results of a simulation of a typical triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{\varepsilon} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$) and the corresponding specimen.

We see similarly to what has been noted at the lab, the axial strain measurement is slightly 339 affected, the dispersion shown between global and local measurements is acceptable. Regarding 340 the volumetric strains, the difference is out of the usual ranges and patterns (see Figure 2). At a 34 deviatoric stress level of ≈ 4 MPa, the first set (closest to the inclusions) measures significantly 342 important radial strains due to the local appearance of tensile stresses (see Figure 11) and we see 343 a local dilatancy onset. On the other hand, the second set (furthest from the inclusions) only sees 344 contractancy until the end of the simulation: the radial strains in that location of the specimen were 345 never important because tensile stresses did not appear there. It is not until the deviatoric stress 346 reaches ≈ 27 MPa that the whole specimen's volume begins to increase. The information provided 347 by the sets of gauges are true but have unexpected patterns and dilatancy onset values because they 348 capture very local phenomena. 349

In this investigation we have provided a possible interpretation to cases like the ones presented in Figures 3 and 6. We have also given a possible explanation to one of the main conclusions of Rouabhi et al. (2019) which states that the friction with the loading platens cannot explain the difference observed between local and global measurements of the volumetric strain.

4.3. Natural Variability and Specimens Representativity

In this section, we investigate the representativity of specimens from a volumetric point of view. We generate a random distribution of spheres with radii ranging from 8 to 20 mm within $\approx 7\%$ of the volume of a 20 cm side length cube. As shown in Figure 18, we virtually sample this cube and generate 4 salt specimens that are 13 cm high with a diameter of 6.5 cm. The inclusions and the halite matrix have the properties mentioned in section 4.1. The mass fraction of insolubles in each specimen is indicated in Figure 18 as well.



Figure 18: A modeled salt block with virtually sampled specimens, the mass fraction of insolubles is indicated for each specimen.

For each of the four shown specimens, we simulate a conventional triaxial compression test where the axial strain rate is fixed at 10^{-6} s⁻¹ and the confining pressure at 5 MPa. The simulations continued until dilatancy onsets were globally seen. The results are shown in Figure 19 in terms of global measurements.



Figure 19: Results of a conventional triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{e} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$), on the specimens shown in Figure 18.

As shown in Figure 19, the axial strain measurements present slight deviations, while the vol-365 umetric ones are significantly different. Because of the size of the insolubles and their distribution 366 within the initial block, none of the sampled specimens were representative of the block from a 367 volumetric perspective. Testing bigger specimens might seem like an immediate and ideal solu-368 tion for this issue. However in practice, we may be constrained by the geometry of the available 369 triaxial cells as explained in section 2 and we may even face cases where the maximum testable 370 size (diameter equal to the coring diameter and a slenderness ratio of two) is not representative of 37 the rock in question. Besides, testing bigger specimens is likely to compromise the precision of 372 the obtained strain measurements; in fact the bigger the specimen, the bigger the required volume 373 of confining oil and the less accurate the obtained volumetric strain measurements. 374

We study a second case scenario, where we generate a random distribution of spheres with radii ranging from 5 to 10 mm within $\approx 5\%$ of the volume of a 20 cm side length cube. As shown in Figure 20, we virtually sample this cube and generate 3 salt specimens that are 13 cm high with a diameter of 6.5 cm. Using the same properties for the inclusions and the halite matrix as the previous case, the mass fraction of insolubles in each specimen is indicated in Figure 20. We simulate the same test as performed on the specimens shown in Figure 19 and we present the corresponding results in Figure 21.



Figure 20: A modeled salt block with virtually sampled specimens, the mass fraction of insolubles is indicated for each specimen



Figure 21: Results of a conventional triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{\varepsilon} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$), on the specimens shown in Figure 20.

In this case, the inclusions size is small compared to the dimensions of the specimen, in fact 382 for all three of the cases we have $R_{max}/R_{spec} \approx 0.29$ where R_{max} is the radius of the largest sphere 383 included within the halite matrix and R_{spec} is the radius of the specimen. Besides there are more 384 inclusions in these specimens (14 for C1, 12 for C2 and 13 for C3) than the ones from the first 385 scenario (Figure 18) and they are evenly distributed within the volumes. These reasons lead to 386 the fact that we see almost no dispersion neither in the axial nor in the volumetric strain measure-387 ments : we are addressing an equivalent homogeneous material. Consequently in similar cases, we 388 can safely adjust a phenomenological model and use the resulting parameter set for the concerned 389 underground facility. 390

To illustrate this, we use the same constitutive model introduced in section 3 to fit the curve C1 391 in Figure 21. We assume that the stress and strain fields within the specimen are homogeneous, 392 all the stresses are compressive and therefore the tensile mechanism cannot be activated. We set 393 $z \neq 0$ in order to reproduce the volumetric strain. In other words, the results shown in Figure 21 394 for the specimen C1, are considered experimental data to fit with the the proposed model under 395 the assumptions stated. Figure 22 shows the fitting of these data with the parameter set given in 396 Table 3. As it can be seen, the phenomenological model, where dilatancy is taken into account on 397 a constitutive level, matches very well the results. 398



Figure 22: Fitting of a conventional triaxial compression test (P=5 MPa and $\dot{\varepsilon} = 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$) conducted on specimen C1 shown in Figure 20.

Elasticity					
Ε	ν				
22523	0.29				
Distorsion					
a	k	b	В	Κ	С
0.21	2.7	0.29	0.03	0.1	0
Dilatancy					
z	п	Ν	т	М	
1.3	1.07	0.0012	2.05	0.0058	
Tension					
d	Λ	R_t	S	S	
10	0	0	1	1	

Table 3: Parameters used to fit the triaxial test results C1 shown in Figure 21. The unit system is such that strain is in μ m/m, stress is in MPa and time in days.

399 5. Conclusions

In this paper, the volumetric strain measurements were experimentally investigated through the analysis of over 120 typical triaxial compression tests on salt specimens from different locations. The difference between local and global measurements exhibited during this analysis, raised questions concerning the effect of material spatial heterogeneity on the volumetric behavior and consequently on the representativity of the used specimen. We chose to focus on a specific aspect of material heterogeneity: the presence of nodules of insoluble materials within a pure halite matrix, in order to obtain a qualitative understanding of the issue.

We carried out a numerical study during which salt specimens were considered as cylindrical matrices of pure halite with spherical inclusions. We proved that dilatancy can be a consequence of the specimen's material heterogeneity.

We then investigated the experimental observations and proved that the significant differences (in patterns and the measured dilatancy onsets) between local and global volumetric strain measurements, were satisfactorily explained by the material spatial heterogeneity.

Finally, found that the presence of nodules of insoluble materials within a salt rock could lead to representativity issues. And in that case, we propose the following general methodology :

Characterize one of the used specimens (known to be not representative): volume fraction
 of insoluble materials, the nature of the inclusions (thus getting an estimation of their elastic
 constants), the concentration zones of heterogeneity.

418 2. Model this specimen as a two-phase medium composed of a pure halite matrix and nodules
419 of insolubles.

3. Perform a history matching of the experimental data with a given constitutive model (in
 which dilatancy results from the activation of a tensile mechanism induced by the presence
 of heterogeneities) on the modeled structure.

423
 4. Once a parameter set is obtained, model a representative specimen: containing much more
 424 inclusions of a negligible size compared to the dimensions of the specimen.

- 5. Simulate the test conducted in the lab on the representative specimen using the same constitutive model from step 3 with the parameter set resulting from the history matching.
- 6. The obtained results are supposed to be representative of the rock in question. They can
 be fit with a given phenomenological constitutive model assuming the homogeneity of the
 stress field. Dilatancy in the chosen model should be taken into account on a constitutive
 level. The resulting parameter set can then be used for the corresponding rock salt.

⁴³¹ This methodology combines experimental work with numerical modeling in order to overcome
 ⁴³² specimens representativity issues and the limitations of laboratory testing procedures.

433 Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank their colleagues Michel Tijani and Faouzi Hadj-Hassen from
 MINES ParisTech for their valuable contributions.

436 **References**

- Bays, C. A., 1963. Use of salt cavities for underground storage. In: Symposium on Salt.; Northern Ohio Geological
 Society. Cleveland, Ohio, pp. 564–578.
- 439 Chemin, P., Nov. 1990. Etude du rôle des inclusions fluides dans les mécanismes de déformation des roches halitiques.
- 440 Application aux formations salifères du bassin bressan. Theses, Ecole Nationale des Ponts et Chaussées.
- 441 DeVries, K., Mellegard, K., October 2010. Effect of specimen preconditioning on salt dilation onset. In: SMRI fall
- ⁴⁴² 2010 technical conference. Leipzig, Germany.
- DeVries, K., Mellegard, K., Callahan, G., Goodman, W., 2005. Cavern roof stability for natural gas storage in bedded
 salt. Technical report de-fg26-02nt41651, RESPEC, Rapid City, South Dakota.
- ⁴⁴⁵ DeVries, K. L., Mellegard, K. D., Callahan, G. D., 11 2002. Salt damage criterion proof-of-concept research. Techni ⁴⁴⁶ cal report rsi-1675 de-fc26-00nt41026, RESPEC, Rapid city, South Dakota.
- 447 Gillhaus, A., Crotogino, F., Albes, D., 2006. Compilation and evaluation of bedded salt cavern characteristics impor-
- tant to successful cavern sealing, part 1: Worldwide bedded slat deposits and bedded salt cavern characteristics.
- ⁴⁴⁹ 2003-5-smri.solution mining research institute research project report.
- Günther, R.-M., Salzer, K., Popp, T., Lüdeling, C., 09 2015. Steady-state creep of rock salt: Improved approaches for
 lab determination and modelling. Rock Mechanics and Rock Engineering 48.
- Habibi, R., 2019. An investigation into design concepts, design methods and stability criteria of salt caverns. Oil Gas
 Sci. Technol. Rev. IFP Energies nouvelles 74, 14.
- 454 Heusermann, S., Rolfs, O., Schmidt, U., 2003. Nonlinear finite-element analysis of solution mined storage caverns in
- rock salt using the lubby2 constitutive model. Computers Structures 81 (8), 629 638, k.J Bathe 60th Anniversary
 Issue.
- Hou, Z., 2003. Mechanical and hydraulic behavior of rock salt in the excavation disturbed zone around underground
 facilities. International Journal of Rock Mechanics and Mining Sciences 40 (5), 725 738.
- Labaune, P., 10 2018. Comportement thermomécanique du sel gemme : Application au dimensionnement des cavités.
 Ph.D. thesis.
- Labaune, P., Rouabhi, A., Tijani, M., Blanco-Martín, L., You, T., Feb 2018. Dilatancy criteria for salt cavern design: A
 comparison between stress- and strain-based approaches. Rock Mechanics and Rock Engineering 51 (2), 599–611.
- 463 Mansouri, H., Prior, D. J., Ajalloeian, R., Elyaszadeh, R., 2019. Deformation and recrystallization mechanisms in-
- 464 ferred from microstructures of naturally deformed rock salt from the diapiric stem and surface glaciers of a salt
- diapir in southern iran. Journal of Structural Geology 121, 10 24.
- ⁴⁶⁶ Medina-Cetina, Z., Rechenmacher, A., 01 2009. Influence of boundary conditions, specimen geometry and material
- ⁴⁶⁷ heterogeneity on model calibration from triaxial tests. International Journal for Numerical and Analytical Methods
- 468 in Geomechanics 34, 627–643.
- ⁴⁶⁹ Mellegard, K., Callahan, G., Devries, K. L., 01 2005. Lode angle effects on the deformational properties of natural

- 470 rock salt. In: American Rock Mechanics Association.
- 471 Munson, D., Dawson, P., 1981. Salt constitutive modeling using mechanism maps. In: First conference on the me-
- chanical behavior of salt. pp. 717–737.
- ⁴⁷³ Popp, T., Kern, H., 1998. Ultrasonic wave velocities, gas permeability and porosity in natural and granular rock salt.
- 474 Physics and Chemistry of the Earth 23(3), 373 378.
- ⁴⁷⁵ Roberts, L. A., Buchholz, S. A., Mellegard, K. D., Düsterloh, U., Nov 2015. Cyclic loading effects on the creep and
- dilation of salt rock. Rock Mechanics and Rock Engineering 48 (6), 2581–2590.
- 477 Rouabhi, A., Labaune, P., Tijani, M., Gatelier, N., Hévin, G., 2019. Phenomenological behavior of rock salt: On the
- influence of laboratory conditions on the dilatancy onset. Journal of Rock Mechanics and Geotechnical Engineer-ing.
- Schulze, O., Popp, T., Kern, H., 2001. Development of damage and permeability in deforming rock salt. Engineering
 Geology 61 (2), 163 180, geosciences and Nuclear Waste Disposal.
- 482 Speranza, G., Vona, A., Vinciguerra, S., Romano, C., 2016. Relating natural heterogeneities and rheological properties
- 483 of rocksalt: New insights from microstructural observations and petrophylisical parameters on messinian halites
- from the italian peninsula. Tectonophysics 666, 103 120.
- Stormont, J., 1997. In situ gas permeability measurements to delineate damage in rock salt. International Journal of
 Rock Mechanics and Mining Sciences 34 (7), 1055 1064.
- ⁴⁸⁷ Thiemeyer, N., Habersetzer, J., Peinl, M., Zulauf, G., Hammer, J., 2015. The application of high resolution x-ray com-
- ⁴⁸⁸ puted tomography on naturally deformed rock salt: Multi-scale investigations of the structural inventory. Journal
 ⁴⁸⁹ of Structural Geology 77, 92–106.
- ⁴⁹⁰ Thiemeyer, N., Zulauf, G., Mertineit, M., Linckens, J., Pusch, M., Hammer, J., 2016. Microfabrics and 3d grain shape
- of gorleben rock salt: Constraints on deformation mechanisms and paleodifferential stress. Tectonophysics 676, 1
 19.
- Tijani, M., Apr. 2008. Contribution à l'étude thermomécanique des cavités réalisées par lessivage dans des formations
 géologiques salines. Habilitation à diriger des recherches, Université Pierre et Marie Curie Paris VI.
- Tijani, M., Vouille, G., Hugout, B., 1983. Le sel gemme en tant que liquide visqueux. In: Le sel gemme en tant que
 liquide visqueux. Melbourne, Australia, pp. 241–246.
- ⁴⁹⁷ Tsang, C.-F., Bernier, F., Davies, C., 2005. Geohydromechanical processes in the excavation damaged zone in crys-
- talline rock, rock salt, and indurated and plastic clays—in the context of radioactive waste disposal. International
- Journal of Rock Mechanics and Mining Sciences 42 (1), 109 125.
- 500 Ulusay, R., Hudson, J., for Rock Mechanics. Commission on Testing Methods, I. S., 2007. The Complete ISRM
- ⁵⁰¹ Suggested Methods for Rock Characterization, Testing and Monitoring: 1974-2006. International Society for Rock
- 502 Mechanics, Commission on Testing Methods.
- ⁵⁰³ Van-Hasselt, B., 12 1991. Évaluation qualitative du rôle de la texture dans le fluage du sel bressan. Ph.D. thesis.

- Wang, T., Li, J., Jing, G., Zhang, Q., Yang, C., Daemen, J., 2019. Determination of the maximum allowable gas
- pressure for an underground gas storage salt cavern a case study of jintan, china. Journal of Rock Mechanics and
- 506 Geotechnical Engineering 11 (2), 251 262.
- ⁵⁰⁷ Wang, T., Yang, C., Chen, J., Daemen, J., 2018. Geomechanical investigation of roof failure of china's first gas storage
- salt cavern. Engineering Geology 243, 59 69.
- 509 Wawersik, W. R., Hannum, D. W., 1980. Mechanical behavior of new mexico rock salt in triaxial compression up to
- 510 200c. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth 85 (B2), 891–900.